

Code No. and Date Received	Name and Address of Applicant	Description and Location of Proposed Development
15/0624/FULL 09.10.2015	Mr J S Khehra Highland Farm Mountain Road Bedwas Caerphilly CF83 8ES	Erect extension and refurbish existing dwelling Highland Farm Mountain Road Bedwas Caerphilly CF83 8ES

APPLICATION TYPE: Full Application

SITE AND DEVELOPMENT

Location: On the western side of Mountain Road, Bedwas.

Site description: The host dwelling is a single-storey former stables converted to a domestic dwelling containing five bedrooms within open countryside north of the settlement of Bedwas. The site has an entrance gate off Mountain Road and the building is set back from the road down a driveway. The site has screening in the form of hedges on the southern and eastern sides and is surrounded by open fields on all sides apart from to the east where Mountain Road runs in a broadly north-south direction. The nearest dwelling is approximately 70 metres to the south east. The topography of the land broadly falls from North to South.

Development: Demolish existing detached garage and construct two-storey extension to the western end elevation. The extension would provide a new garage with separate Tractor Garage and upper and lower lounge areas. The development also contains details of refurbishment to the existing dwelling including changing the external appearance of the property from timber to render with stonework detailing and new single ply membrane roofing.

Dimensions: The approximate dimensions of the extension are 10.3m long by 13m wide (except tractor garage element which is 8m wide). The height varies from 4.4m on the principal elevation increasing to 5.4m at the rear elevation.

Materials: Existing materials: Walls: Timber Clad, Roof: Green Metal Clad.

Proposed Material: Walls: White render and stonework, Roof: Dark Grey Single ply membrane.

Ancillary development, e.g. parking: None.

Cont'd.....

Application No 15/0624/FULL Continued.

PLANNING HISTORY 2005 TO PRESENT

P/06/0684 - Construct detached garage - Refused 22.06.07 - Appeal Dismissed.

08/0910/FULL - Construct detached double garage - Granted 02.10.08.

14/0061/FULL - Demolish existing garage and construct two-storey extension to west elevation - Granted 26.03.14.

POLICY

LOCAL DEVELOPMENT PLAN

Site Allocation: The land is outside the settlement boundary.

Policies:

SP5 (Settlement Boundaries)

CW2 (Amenity)

CW3 (Design Considerations - Highways)

CW4 (Natural Heritage Protection)

CW15 (General Locational Constraints)

CW20 (Locational Constraints - Conversion, Extension and Replacement of Buildings in the Countryside)

NH1 (Special Landscape Areas).

NATIONAL POLICY Planning Policy Wales, Technical Advice Note 12: Design.

ENVIRONMENTAL IMPACT ASSESSMENT

Did the application have to be screened for an EIA? No.

Was an EIA required? Not Applicable.

COAL MINING LEGACY

Is the site within an area where there are mining legacy issues? No, this matter will be resolved through the Building Regulations.

Cont'd.....

Application No. 15/0624/FULL Continued.

CONSULTATION

Countryside And Landscape Services - The Council's Ecologist has no objections to the development subject to conditions and informative notes in relation to bats.

Bedwas, Trethomas & Machen Community Council - Objection - Overdevelopment of the area.

ADVERTISEMENT

Extent of advertisement: The application was advertised via a site notice.

Response: No response received relative to the consultation exercise.

Summary of observations: None.

SECTION 17 CRIME AND DISORDER ACT

What is the likely effect of the determination of this application on the need for the Local Planning Authority to do all it reasonably can to prevent crime and disorder in its area? It is not considered that crime and disorder will be materially affected by the development.

EU HABITATS DIRECTIVE

Does the development affect any protected wildlife species?

Based on current evidence, this is unlikely to be a significant issue in this case, but an advisory note will be attached to the consent and sent to the applicant as a precautionary measure.

COMMUNITY INFRASTRUCTURE LEVY

Is this development Community Infrastructure Levy liable? Yes this site falls within the Higher Viability area, and the extension has a floor area of 101.79 square metre (having subtracted the existing garage space) resulting in a CIL payment of £4071.60.

Cont'd.....

Application No. 15/0624/FULL Continued.

ANALYSIS

Policies: The application dwelling is a former stable building where its subsequent change of use to a domestic dwelling became immune from enforcement action and a residential use was established at the site. The property benefits from an existing extant planning permission for an extension on the same side end of the building as the current application. This permission has not at present been implemented and therefore should this application be approved it would only be possible for one of the permissions to be implemented.

Extant Planning Permission

The extant planning permission was granted in March 2014 and approved a side extension to the western end of the property. During the determination of the application following officer negotiation the design of the extension was amended and a revised scheme was approved. The material for the amended scheme ensured the extension matched the existing building, with the walls clad in matching timber and metal sheet roofing consistent with the existing roof covering. The permitted extension projected 6.2m in length from the western side of the dwelling and was 10.1m in depth and 4.4m in height including a nominal 0.2m step down from the existing ridge height of the building. The floorplans showed it would provide a large garage accessed via the principal north facing elevation and behind that a lounge area (6m by 3.6m) with an upper lounge area above in the roofspace. The design included a large glazed area on the rear south facing elevation incorporating a gable roof feature.

Current Planning Application

The current application differs from the extant permission in the following ways. It has a wider projection (10m) from the existing western end of the dwelling to accommodate a tractor garage at the western end. A double garage is proposed to be accessed from the principal north facing elevation and a lounge area behind, however this is larger than the previous permission (approx internal dimensions 6.2m by 6.3m). An upper lounge area is also proposed (approx internal dimensions 6.2m by 6.3m) with a glass and stainless steel balcony (2m 4.9m). The height of the extension viewed from the front (northern) elevation is 4.4metres in height, however the rear elevation is proposed to be 5.4m high but its roof height remains 0.2m below the original dwelling ridge height as the ground level (which already falls away) will be excavated by just over a metre.

Included within the application are proposals to reclad the existing dwelling changing it from the existing timber clad walling to a white render and removal of the existing green metal ribbed roofing to a new ply membrane in a grey colour. New stonework elements are proposed on the principal elevation.

Cont'd....

Application No. 15/0624/FULL Continued.

Visual Impact of the Development

The application site is located within an area designated as a Special Landscape Area (Policy NH1.4 North Caerphilly) outside of the settlement boundary.

It is considered that Local Development Plan Policies CW20 (Locational Constraints - Conversion, Extension and Replacement of Buildings in the Countryside) and Policy NH1 (Special Landscape Areas) are key policy considerations in the determination of the application.

Part A of Policy CW20 requires development proposals to ensure that the proposed use, scale, form, siting, design and materials are suitable within its context. In addition in relation to extensions of buildings in the countryside Part C requires:-

- i) The scale, form and design of the extension respects the scale and character of the original building
- ii) The extension does not result in the loss of undeveloped countryside
- iii) The extension does not result in the domestication of urbanisation of an otherwise rural setting.

In relation to Part A and Part C criteria (i) and (ii) it is considered that the development is not acceptable as the proposed extension and refurbishment of the building would have a significant detrimental impact on the simple form of the building which at present retains many of the characteristics and appearance of its former use as a stable. Furthermore it is considered that the extant permission provided a reasonable scale of extension which the current application now seeks to go significantly beyond.

In regard to the scale of the development the extension would be substantially larger than the extant permission resulting in a significant increase in the width of the original building of approximately 50% as opposed to an approximate 30% increase in the previously permitted extension. In this regard it is considered that the current application does not respect the scale and character of the original building. The massing of the building would also be increased in the current proposal to an extent where it is considered it does not respect the scale of the original building. It is considered the proposed development does not accord with Part A or criterion (i) of part C of Policy CW20.

Criterion C(ii) relates to the loss of undeveloped countryside. As the proposed extension would be within the existing curtilage of the dwelling it is considered that the proposed development confirms to this criterion.

Cont'd.....

Application No. 15/0624/FULL Continued.

Criterion C (iii) requires proposals to avoid the domestication or urbanisation of an otherwise rural setting. The appearance of the building would be changed significantly from the existing building within the current application which would render the majority of the external envelope of the building with the addition of a central porch on the principal elevation to be completed in stonework. The previous permission retained the existing timber cladding and the proposed extension matched this and the metal roof covering. In this regard there is a clear difference in the current application. In addition the proposed extension would increase the width of the building with a significant projection present to the rear elevation with the addition of a balcony structure. This is considered to result in a development which is out of keeping of the original building's simple linear form and unlike the previous permitted extension which limited the increase in the width of the property the current proposal would result in substantial domestication and urbanisation of the dwelling by changes to its facade treatment, massing of elevations and the addition of the balcony. It is considered that the present scheme does not accord with the requirements of criterion C (iii) of Policy CW2.

The adopted Local Development Plan Policy on Special Landscape Areas (Policy NH1) requires the designated areas to be protected. The Appendices to the Local Development Plan include in the description of the Special Landscape Area for North Caerphilly (NH1.4) that in relation to Development Control issues that "The whole area should be protected from inappropriate development". It is considered for the reasons outlined above that the design and appearance of the proposed development would not protect the Special Landscape Area and therefore it would be contrary to Policy NH1.

The planning history for the site indicates that planning permission (P/06/0684) was refused for a double garage at the site in June 2007. This decision was subject to a Planning Appeal (appeal ref: APP/K6920/A/07/2061467) which was subsequently dismissed by the Planning Inspector. Within the reasons for the decision reached the Inspector highlighted that "In order to retain the rural character of the locality, it is important that any new buildings are no larger than necessary". Furthermore the inspector, whilst noting the certificate of lawfulness issued for residential use of the stable building, stated "it still retains a largely rural appearance redolent of its original authorised use and appropriate to its rural location. The addition of a large building of clearly urban design would not be in keeping with this generally rural appearance". Whilst the current application seeks to extend rather than provide a separate new building it is considered that the comments in relation to retaining the character of the original building are equally as pertinent in this application.

Cont'd.....

Application No. 15/0624/FULL Continued.

Members are advised that following the appeal decision referenced above a smaller garage was separately approved and constructed on site and that garage would be demolished if the current application were granted and implemented. The garaging provision within the current application include both a substantial double garage and an internally separated but structurally linked 'Tractor Garage'. The applicant has not provided any evidence of an agricultural justification for the provision of the tractor garage.

Comments from consultees: It is noted that the Community Council have objected on the grounds of overdevelopment of the site. The property has a large curtilage and therefore it is not considered that the development would result in overdevelopment of the site.

Comments from public: None.

Other material considerations: None.

RECOMMENDATION that Permission be REFUSED

This permission is subject to the following condition(s)

- 01) The development by reason of its scale, form, design and materials fails to respect the scale and character of the original building resulting in an unacceptable domestication and urbanisation of an otherwise rural setting contrary to Policy CW20 (Locational Constraints Conversion, extension and replacement of buildings in the Countryside), and constitutes inappropriate development within a designated Special Landscape Area contrary to Policy NH1 both policies of the Caerphilly County Borough Local Development Plan up to 2021 - Adopted November 2010.